

**U.S. House of Representatives
Committee on Ways and Means
Subcommittee on Select Revenue Measures
April 26, 2012 - Hearing on Certain Expiring Tax Provisions**

Comments Submitted for the Record

The undersigned residents and property owners of the State of California respectfully submit these comments in response to the April 26, 2012 Hearing on Certain Expiring Tax Provisions. Our comments are limited to the Production Tax Credit (PTC) for wind energy.

Executive Summary: The PTC is often credited for most of the growth in the wind sector but attributing market activity to the subsidy is overly simplistic and fails to consider other crucial factors driving development. When evaluated against key economic and environment criteria, the cost of the subsidy has proven excessive and the benefits to American taxpayers minimal. If the PTC were to expire, the economics of the industry would shift to States with renewable mandates. Power markets will ultimately confront the real cost of wind energy, and price it accordingly. The overall impact on the industry would be far less severe than proponents claim¹.

Supporting Statements:

High Cost: Since adopted in 1992, the cost of the PTC for wind energy has ballooned from \$5 million/year in 1998 to \$1.5 billion annually today. The open-ended subsidy of 2.2¢/kWh in after-tax income represents a pre-tax value of approximately 3.7¢/kWh. In many regions of the country the PTC now equals, or is greater than, the wholesale price of power. Even if the PTC were to sunset, taxpayers are still obligated to cover nearly \$10 billion in tax credits for wind projects built in the last decade. This is in addition to the \$15 billion debt for wind projects eligible under Section 1603 (including anticipated 2012 grants).

Inefficient: Since the PTC is uniform across the country it is highly inefficient, supporting poorly sited development in some areas while in other areas supporting projects that would have been built regardless of the credit. This is true in Texas and the Pacific Northwest where wind capacity exceeds transmission capacity and wind is curtailed². In New England the PTC likely pays more subsidy than is necessary owing to aggressive State mandates. Utilities in New England routinely sign long-term power contracts for wind at prices significantly above market.

Other factors advancing wind development: The industry insists it's at risk of a slow-down without the PTC. This view ignores other crucial factors driving development including state mandates and natural gas prices. It is not possible given available data to identify the extent to which the PTC has contributed to growth in the sector³. In fact, demand for wind has eroded recently due, in part, to

¹ Linowes et.al. 2012 Congressional Testimony <http://science.house.gov/hearing/subcommittee-investigation-and-oversight-subcommittee-energy-and-environment-%E2%80%93-joint-hearing>

² Wisner and Bolinger, 2010 *Wind Technologies Market Report*, (2011) vii <http://eetd.lbl.gov/ea/ems/reports/lbnl-4820e.pdf>

³ Joint Committee on Taxation, *Present Law And Background Relating To Tax Credits For Electricity Production From Renewable Sources* (2005) 14 <https://www.jct.gov/publications.html?func=startdown&id=1579>

states meeting their renewable mandates. Lower natural gas prices further reduced wind's attractiveness as a 'fuel saver'. The EIA now forecasts flat growth in the wind sector for this decade regardless of what happens with the PTC⁴.

Job losses: Despite billions in public funding the wind sector experienced a net loss of 10,000 direct and indirect jobs in 2010 bringing the total to 75,000⁵ jobs. Most of the remaining jobs are temporary construction positions requiring peak levels of development year-after-year to maintain current levels. Attempts to attribute job creation to the PTC must be tempered with corresponding job losses due to higher renewable energy prices. The State of Vermont found that adding just 50 MWs of renewable energy at higher-than-market electricity prices "had the deleterious effects of reshuffling consumer spending and increasing the cost of production for Vermont businesses⁶." Last year, rural electric ratepayers in Minnesota paid more than \$70 million in above-market energy prices due to the high cost of wind⁷.

Environmental benefits: Wind energy is an unpredictable, variable resource that cannot be relied on to serve load. Its primary benefit is in reducing U.S. electric carbon emissions. According the Navigant⁸, a four year extension of the PTC could avoid an incremental 170 million tons of CO₂. This "best case" estimate is not predicated on an actual working grid region, but if we accept Navigant's estimate the cost to taxpayers is at least \$23/ton CO₂⁹, ten-times the \$1.92/ton market price for offsets in the Northeastern states participating in RGGI! The PTC is a high-priced vehicle for very questionable reductions of CO₂ emissions.

Conclusion: The key question is whether the benefits of the PTC for wind are worth the cost. This 20-year old subsidy is expensive, inefficient, has failed to produce net-job increases that are sustainable, and the cost applied per ton of CO₂ is more than 10x the market price of carbon under RGGI. The U.S. power market has undergone significant change since the PTC was adopted, including deregulation. It is not possible to isolate the extent to which the PTC contributes to wind sector growth¹⁰. Without the PTC, project economics would shift to states with RPS policies. The value of renewable credits might rise in response but power markets will ultimately confront the real cost of wind energy, and price it accordingly.

⁴ EIA, *Annual Energy Outlook 2012* (2012) <http://www.eia.gov/forecasts/aeo/er/>

⁵ Wisner and Bolinger v - Note: No independent audits exist to confirm job counts. Since any new job in the electricity sector must contribute to increasing the cost of electricity, this creates economic de-stimulus.

⁶ VT DPS, *The Economic Impacts of Vermont Feed in Tariffs* (2009) 12
<http://publicservice.vermont.gov/planning/DPS%20White%20Paper%20Feed%20in%20Tariff.pdf>

⁷ Wall Street Journal *Gouged by the Wind* (May 2012)
http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052702303592404577364244006391420.html?mod=googlenews_wsj

⁸ Navigant Consulting, Inc. *Impact of the Production Tax Credit on the U.S. Wind Market* (2011) 38

⁹ Navigant provides no detail on how it determined offsets. Study assumes some wind built without the PTC and only looked at incremental benefit over 4 years (2013-16). The cost per offset is potentially higher than \$23/ton.

¹⁰ Joint Committee on Taxation 14

Supplemental Sheet

Submitted by: Joshua Boswell / 3025 Channel, Ventura, CA. 93003 / rokboz@yahoo.com / 805-490-2773

Date submitted: May 10, 2012

Note: I am submitting the above comments on behalf of the following (142) residents and property owners of the State of California listed on the following five (5) pages.

Meredith McCalmont
3025 Channel Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Roger and Karen Heyrend
379 MacKay Avenue
Ventura, California 93004

Mary Elisabeth Cattani
5100 California Avenue, Suite 234
Bakersfield, California 93309

Sue Walsh
22941 Banducci Road
Tehachapi, California 93561

Mesonika Piecuch
P.O. Box 550
Tehachapi, California 93581

Philippe and Dolores Athuil
416 North Bedford Drive #404
Beverly Hills, California 90210

Stephen F. Rudin
21848 Ferncuko Street
Tehachapi, California 93561

Penelope J. Melko
21848 Ferncuko Street
Tehachapi, California 93561

Don and Kristen Freed
785 Tucker Road
Suite G. PMB #441
Tehachapi, California 92561

Brinton and Ingrid Marsden
8404 Joan Lane
West Hills, California 91304

Wally and Mary Oslie
29312 Sierra Place
Tehachapi, California 93561

Sonny and Helen Prince
18110 Bold Venture Drive
Tehachapi, California 93561

Jacob Miller
472 South Arcade Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Nancy Boswell
472 South Arcade Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Alex Topar
1539 North China Lake Blvd. #236
Ridgecrest, California 93555

Ben White
8202 Solano Street
Ventura, California 93004

Greg and Tamryn Bua
749 Avenida De Las Flores
Thousand Oaks, California 91360

Chris Trama
591 Evergreen Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Joanne Trama
85 Arcade Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Robert A. Miller
205 East Driffill Blvd. #96
Oxnard, California 93030

Troy Overman
1140 Seaward Avenue
Ventura, California 93001

Eddie Duran
8573 Idyllwild Street
Ventura, California 93004

Richard and Donna Roth Phipps
6832 Sagebrush Drive
Quartz Hill, California 93536

Steve and Diana Palmer
17700 Oak Creek Road
Mojave, California 93501

Steve and Donna Newton
9701 Golden Drive
Orangevale, California 95662

Brandie and Jeremy Dunn
P.O. Box 1661
Rosamond, California 93560

Robert E. Burns
18818 Oak Creek Road
Mojave California 93501

Arthur F. Corwin
2747 Northview Avenue
Arroyo Grande, California 93420

Charles and Kathleen Youngstrom
41239 45th Street West
Quartz Hill, California 93536

Katherine Mahan
11344 East Avenue R8
Littlerock, California 93543

Rick Potter
5442 Backus Road
Mojave, California 93501

Russell, Nancy and Tanner Klaussen
145 Oak Drive
Oak View, California 93022

Veronica, Sal and Crystal Jimenez
8573 Idyllwild Street
Ventura, California 93004

Robert and Donna Moran
16875 Blackburn Canyon Road
Tehachapi, California 93561

Doug and Karen Newton
2041 36th Street
Sacramento, California 95817

Louise Newton
3009 Cambridge Road
Cameron Park, California 95682

Alice and Cary Becker
1120 West Avenue J-13
Lancaster, California 93534

Patricia I. Burns
5711 West Avenue M # 169
Quartz Hill, California 93536

Sally J. Woelper
2747 Northview Avenue
Arroyo Grande, California 93420

Tabitha and Tataria Youngstrom
41239 45th Street West
Quartz Hill, California 93536

Sherri Coons
P.O. Box 1661
Rosamond, California 93560

Linda Finch
5442 Backus Road
Mojave, California 93501

Cara Hemme
7701 West Avenue A
Rosamond, California 93560

Tyler Hulse
7701 West Avenue A
Rosamond, California 93560

Mark Mikels
217 Sawday Road
Ramona, California 92065

Kelly Price Miller
26000 Columbia Way
Tehachapi, California 93561

Sid Clark
30167 Aliso Canyon Road
Palmdale, California 93510

Bimmy Keene
817 Lobo Road
Weldon, California 93283

Lisa and Gary Anglin
1739 Isabella Court
Ventura, California 93004

June and Greg Gonzales
6275 Loma Vista Road
Ventura, California 93004

Eva Bontempo
35386 Ardo Court
Fremont, California 94536

Victor and Mellissa Bontempo
2842 Arlington Place
Fremont, California 94555

Charles and Karen Spraggins
811 West Lemon Street
Brea, California 92821

Colin and Tanya Williams
26660 Sutter Court
Tehachapi, California 93561

Terri Duarte
40027 90th Street West
Leona Valley, California 93551

Sallie Chatterton
30167 Aliso Canyon Road
Palmdale, California 93510

Eric Klein
8120 Underwood Avenue
California City, California 93505

John Felber
2931 South Kelso Valley Road
Weldon, California 93283

Martin and Donna Buchalter
236 Purdue Avenue
Ventura, California 93003

Tom Bulmahn
807 Brent Avenue
South Pasadena, California 91030

Jack and Fran Brock
1600 Pasadena Glen Road
Pasadena, California 91106

Nena and Bruce Britt
35478 Gustavo Court
Fremont, California 94536

Richard and Yolanda Llamas
8265 Loma Vista Road
Ventura, California 93004

Elizabeth Elder
1225 South rice Road #4
Ojai, California 93023

Richard and Carmen Eppler
498 South Arcade Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Vera Hollinshead
20691 Lari Mark Street
Perris, California 92370

Carol Muzzillo
10507 Haines Canyon Avenue
Tujunga, California 91042

Loretta Miller
295 South Ventu Park Road
Newbury Park, California 91320

Patrick and Suzanne O'Toole
4949 Foothill Road
Ventura, California 93003

Patricia and Randy Renner
1201 Sandra Circle
Vista, California 92083

Michael and Linda Solano
173 Madison Street
Oceanside, California 92057

Adam and Andrew Fulthorpe
3932 Flower Street
Ventura, California 93003

Shannon Hosford
2384 Warbler Avenue
Ventura, California 93003

Seth and Nichole Jackson
12895 Crescent Bay Court
Yucaipa, California 92399

Tracy Lamprecht
1157 Kingston Lane
Ventura, California 93001

Dennis and Georgia Perry
3074 Bayshore Avenue
Ventura, California 93001

Michael and Juanita Garrido
35442 Gustavo Court
Fremont, California 94536

Miriam and Bill Linwood
716 Main Street
Woodland, California 95695

John and Susan Hayworth
34640 Creekwood Court
Yucaipa, California 92399

Sean O'Toole
245 Walnut Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Terri Roman
11 Lincoln Drive
Ventura, California 93001

Edward Welsh Jr.
1725 Avenida De Aprisa
Camarillo, California 93010

Scott Montgomery
170 Via Pasito
Ventura, California 93003

Margaret Brooks
1159 Badger Circle
Ventura, California 93003

Robin Hober
922 Poli Street
Ventura, California 93001

Justin Eliot
730 New Crest Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Josh Kiroff
599 Camino Del Lago
Newbury Park, California 91320

Sarah Wilcox
1657 Ocean Avenue
Ventura, California 93001

Mark Mahoney
1657 Ocean Avenue
Ventura, California 93001

David Mahoney
360 South F Street
Oxnard, California 93030

Mary Fraser
3225 Central Avenue
Ventura, California 93003

Jordan Duff
3357 Porter Lane
Ventura, California 93003

Robert and Nicole McCalmont
44937 Camino Alamosa
Temecula, California 92592

Julie Crawford
5483 Hollings Street
Ventura, California 93003

Tim Kleier
Ranchers for Responsible Conservation
2020 Eye Street, Suite 201
Bakersfield, California 93301

Jeff and Laura Albaeck
4252 Via Entrada
Newbury Park, California 91320

Irene Matijick
P.O. Box 705
Mojave, California 93502

Scott Thomas Lowe
P.O. Box 705
Mojave, California 93502

Tory Dapello
3357 Porter Lane
Ventura, California 93003

Barbarella Rogers
2926 Apache Avenue
Ventura, California 93001

Chapel West
2926 Apache Avenue
Ventura, California 93001