The undersigned residents and property owners of the State of California respectfully submit these comments in response to the April 26, 2012 Hearing on Certain Expiring Tax Provisions. Our comments are limited to the Production Tax Credit (PTC) for wind energy.

**Executive Summary:** The PTC is often credited for most of the growth in the wind sector but attributing market activity to the subsidy is overly simplistic and fails to consider other crucial factors driving development. When evaluated against key economic and environment criteria, the cost of the subsidy has proven excessive and the benefits to American taxpayers minimal. If the PTC were to expire, the economics of the industry would shift to States with renewable mandates. Power markets will ultimately confront the real cost of wind energy, and price it accordingly. The overall impact on the industry would be far less severe than proponents claim.

**Supporting Statements:**

**High Cost:** Since adopted in 1992, the cost of the PTC for wind energy has ballooned from $5 million/year in 1998 to $1.5 billion annually today. The open-ended subsidy of 2.2¢/kWh in after-tax income represents a pre-tax value of approximately 3.7¢/kWh. In many regions of the country the PTC now equals, or is greater than, the wholesale price of power. Even if the PTC were to sunset, taxpayers are still obligated to cover nearly $10 billion in tax credits for wind projects built in the last decade. This is in addition to the $15 billion debt for wind projects eligible under Section 1603 (including anticipated 2012 grants).

**Inefficient:** Since the PTC is uniform across the country it is highly inefficient, supporting poorly sited development in some areas while in other areas supporting projects that would have been built regardless of the credit. This is true in Texas and the Pacific Northwest where wind capacity exceeds transmission capacity and wind is curtailed. In New England the PTC likely pays more subsidy than is necessary owing to aggressive State mandates. Utilities in New England routinely sign long-term power contracts for wind at prices significantly above market.

**Other factors advancing wind development:** The industry insists it's at risk of a slow-down without the PTC. This view ignores other crucial factors driving development including state mandates and natural gas prices. It is not possible given available data to identify the extent to which the PTC has contributed to growth in the sector. In fact, demand for wind has eroded recently due, in part, to...

---


3 Joint Committee on Taxation, *Present Law And Background Relating To Tax Credits For Electricity Production From Renewable Sources* (2005) 14 https://www.jct.gov/publications.html?func=startdown&id=1579
states meeting their renewable mandates. Lower natural gas prices further reduced wind's attractiveness as a 'fuel saver'. The EIA now forecasts flat growth in the wind sector for this decade regardless of what happens with the PTC\(^4\).

**Job losses:** Despite billions in public funding the wind sector experienced a net loss of 10,000 direct and indirect jobs in 2010 bringing the total to 75,000\(^5\) jobs. Most of the remaining jobs are temporary construction positions requiring peak levels of development year-after-year to maintain current levels. Attempts to attribute job creation to the PTC must be tempered with corresponding job losses due to higher renewable energy prices. The State of Vermont found that adding just 50 MWs of renewable energy at higher-than-market electricity prices "had the deleterious effects of reshuffling consumer spending and increasing the cost of production for Vermont businesses\(^6\)." Last year, rural electric ratepayers in Minnesota paid more than $70 million in above-market energy prices due to the high cost of wind\(^7\).

**Environmental benefits:** Wind energy is an unpredictable, variable resource that cannot be relied on to serve load. Its primary benefit is in reducing U.S. electric carbon emissions. According the Navigant\(^8\), a four year extension of the PTC could avoid an incremental 170 million tons of CO2. This "best case" estimate is not predicated on an actual working grid region, but if we accept Navigant's estimate the cost to taxpayers is at least $23/ton CO2\(^9\), ten-times the $1.92/ton market price for offsets in the Northeastern states participating in RGGI! The PTC is a high-priced vehicle for very questionable reductions of CO2 emissions.

**Conclusion:** The key question is whether the benefits of the PTC for wind are worth the cost. This 20-year old subsidy is expensive, inefficient, has failed to produce net-job increases that are sustainable, and the cost applied per ton of CO2 is more than 10x the market price of carbon under RGGI. The U.S. power market has undergone significant change since the PTC was adopted, including deregulation. It is not possible to isolate the extent to which the PTC contributes to wind sector growth\(^10\). Without the PTC, project economics would shift to states with RPS policies. The value of renewable credits might rise in response but power markets will ultimately confront the real cost of wind energy, and price it accordingly.

---


\(^5\) Wiser and Bolinger v - Note: No independent audits exist to confirm job counts. Since any new job in the electricity sector must contribute to increasing the cost of electricity, this creates economic de-stimulus.


\(^8\) Navigant Consulting, Inc. *Impact of the Production Tax Credit on the U.S. Wind Market* (2011) 38

\(^9\) Navigant provides no detail on how it determined offsets. Study assumes some wind built without the PTC and only looked at incremental benefit over 4 years (2013-16). The cost per offset is potentially higher than $23/ton.

\(^10\) Joint Committee on Taxation 14
Supplemental Sheet

Submitted by: Joshua Boswell / 3025 Channel, Ventura, CA. 93003 / rokboz@yahoo.com / 805-490-2773

Date submitted: May 10, 2012

Note: I am submitting the above comments on behalf of the following (142) residents and property owners of the State of California listed on the following five (5) pages.
Meredith McCalmont
3025 Channel Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Roger and Karen Heyrend
379 MacKay Avenue
Ventura, California 93004

Mary Elisabeth Cattani
5100 California Avenue, Suite 234
Bakersfield, California 93309

Sue Walsh
22941 Banducci Road
Tehachapi, California 93561

Mesonika Piecuch
P.O. Box 550
Tehachapi, California 93581

Philippe and Dolores Athuil
416 North Bedford Drive #404
Beverly Hills, California 90210

Stephen F. Rudin
21848 Ferncuko Street
Tehachapi, California 93561

Penelope J. Melko
21848 Ferncuko Street
Tehachapi, California 93561

Don and Kristen Freed
785 Tucker Road
Suite G. PMB #441
Tehachapi, California 92561

Brinton and Ingred Marsden
8404 Joan Lane
West Hills, California 91304

Wally and Mary Oslie
29312 Sierra Place
Tehachapi, California 93561

Sonny and Helen Prince
18110 Bold Venture Drive
Tehachapi, California 93561

Jacob Miller
472 South Arcade Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Nancy Boswell
472 South Arcade Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Alex Topar
1539 North China Lake Blvd. #236
Ridgecrest, California 93555

Ben White
8202 Solano Street
Ventura, California 93004

Greg and Tamryn Bua
749 Avenida De Las Flores
Thousand Oaks, California 91360

Chris Trama
591 Evergreen Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Joanne Trama
85 Arcade Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Robert A. Miller
205 East Driffill Blvd. #96
Oxnard, California 93030
Troy Overman  
1140 Seaward Avenue  
Ventura, California 93001

Russell, Nancy and Tanner Klaussen  
145 Oak Drive  
Oak View, California 93022

Eddie Duran  
8573 Idyllwild Street  
Ventura, California 93004

Veronica, Sal and Crystal Jimenez  
8573 Idyllwild Street  
Ventura, California 93004

Richard and Donna Roth Phipps  
6832 Sagebrush Drive  
Quartz Hill, California 93536

Robert and Donna Moran  
16875 Blackburn Canyon Road  
Tehachapi, California 93561

Steve and Diana Palmer  
17700 Oak Creek Road  
Mojave, California 93501

Doug and Karen Newton  
2041 36th Street  
Sacramento, California 95817

Steve and Donna Newton  
9701 Golden Drive  
Orangevale, California 95662

Louise Newton  
3009 Cambridge Road  
Cameron Park, California 95682

Brandie and Jeremy Dunn  
P.O. Box 1661  
Rosamond, California 93560

Alice and Cary Becker  
1120 West Avenue J-13  
Lancaster, California 95354

Robert E. Burns  
18818 Oak Creek Road  
Mojave California 93501

Patricia L. Burns  
5711 West Avenue M # 169  
Quartz Hill, California 93536

Arthur F. Corwin  
2747 Northview Avenue  
Arroyo Grande, California 93420

Sally J. Woelpner  
2747 Northview Avenue  
Arroyo Grande, California 93420

Charles and Kathleen Youngstrom  
41239 45th Street West  
Quartz Hill, California 93536

Tabitha and Tataria Youngstrom  
41239 45th Street West  
Quartz Hill, California 93536

Katherine Mahan  
11344 East Avenue R8  
Littlerock, California 93543

Sherri Coons  
P.O. Box 1661  
Rosamond, California 93560

Rick Potter  
5442 Backus Road  
Mojave, California 93501

Linda Finch  
5442 Backus Road  
Mojave, California 93501
Cara Hemme  
7701 West Avenue A  
Rosamond, California 93560  
Charles and Karen Spraggins  
811 West Lemon Street  
Brea, California 92821  

Tyler Hulsey  
7701 West Avenue A  
Rosamond, California 93560  
Colin and Tanya Williams  
26660 Sutter Court  
Tehachapi, California 93561  

Mark Mikels  
217 Sawday Road  
Ramona, California 92065  
Terri Duarte  
40027 90th Street West  
Leona Valley, California 93551  

Kelly Price Miller  
26000 Columbia Way  
Tehachapi, California 93561  
Sallie Chatterton  
30167 Aliso Canyon Road  
Palmdale, California 93510  

Sid Clark  
30167 Aliso Canyon Road  
Palmdale, California 93510  
Eric Klein  
8120 Underwood Avenue  
California City, California 93505  

Bimmy Keene  
817 Lobo Road  
Weldon, California 93283  
John Felber  
2931 South Kelso Valley Road  
Weldon, California 93283  

Lisa and Gary Anglin  
1739 Isabella Court  
Ventura, California 93004  
Martin and Donna Buchalter  
236 Purdue Avenue  
Ventura, California 93003  

June and Greg Gonzales  
6275 Loma Vista Road  
Ventura, California 93004  
Tom Bulmahn  
807 Brent Avenue  
South Pasadena, California 91030  

Eva Bontempo  
35386 Ardo Court  
Fremont, California 94536  
Jack and Fran Brock  
1600 Pasadena Glen Road  
Pasadena, California 91106  

Victor and Mellissa Bontempo  
2842 Arlington Place  
Fremont, California 94555  
Nena and Bruce Britt  
35478 Gustavo Court  
Fremont, California 94536
Richard and Yolanda Llamas
8265 Loma Vista Road
Ventura, California 93004

Seth and Nichole Jackson
12895 Crescent Bay Court
Yucaipa, California 92399

Elizabeth Elder
1225 South rice Road #4
Ojai, California 93023

Tracy Lamprecht
1157 Kingston Lane
Ventura, California 93001

Richard and Carmen Eppler
498 South Arcade Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Dennis and Georgia Perry
3074 Bayshore Avenue
Ventura, California 93001

Vera Hollinshead
20691 Lari Mark Street
Perris, California 92370

Michael and Juanita Garrido
35442 Gustavo Court
Fremont, California 94536

Carol Muzzillo
10507 Haines Canyon Avenue
Tujunga, California 91042

Miriam and Bill Linwood
716 Main Street
Woodland, California 95695

Loretta Miller
295 South Ventu Park Road
Newbury Park, California 91320

John and Susan Hayworth
34640 Creekwood Court
Yucaipa, California 92399

Patrick and Suzanne O'Toole
4949 Foothill Road
Ventura, California 93003

Sean O'Toole
245 Walnut Drive
Ventura, California 93003

Patricia and Randy Renner
1201 Sandra Circle
Vista, California 92083

Terri Roman
11 Lincoln Drive
Ventura, California 93001

Michael and Linda Solano
173 Madison Street
Oceanside, California 92057

Edward Welsh Jr.
1725 Avenida De Aprisa
Camarillo, California 93010

Adam and Andrew Fulthorpe
3932 Flower Street
Ventura, California 93003

Scott Montgomery
170 Via Pasito
Ventura, California 93003

Shannon Hosford
2384 Warbler Avenue
Ventura, California 93003

Margaret Brooks
1159 Badger Circle
Ventura, California 93003
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address 1</th>
<th>Address 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Robin Hober</td>
<td>922 Poli Street</td>
<td>730 New Crest Drive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ventura, California 93001</td>
<td>Ventura, California 93003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justin Eliot</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Josh Kiroff</td>
<td>599 Camino Del Lago</td>
<td>1657 Ocean Avenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Newbury Park, California 91320</td>
<td>Ventura, California 93001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah Wilcox</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Mahoney</td>
<td>1657 Ocean Avenue</td>
<td>360 South F Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ventura, California 93001</td>
<td>Oxnard, California 93030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Mahoney</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Fraser</td>
<td>3225 Central Avenue</td>
<td>3357 Porter Lane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ventura, California 93003</td>
<td>Ventura, California 93003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan Duff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert and Nicole McCalmont</td>
<td>44937 Camino Alamosa</td>
<td>5483 Hollings Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Temecula, California 92592</td>
<td>Ventura, California 93003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julie Crawford</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tim Kleier</td>
<td>Ranchers for Responsible Conservation</td>
<td>4252 Via Entrada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2020 Eye Street, Suite 201</td>
<td>Newbury Park, California 91320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jeff and Laura Albaeck</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irene Matijick</td>
<td>P.O. Box 705</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mojave, California 93502</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott Thomas Lowe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tory Dapello</td>
<td>3357 Porter Lane</td>
<td>2926 Apache Avenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ventura, California 93003</td>
<td>Ventura, California 93001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Babarella Rogers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapel West</td>
<td>2926 Apache Avenue</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ventura, California 93001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>