The undersigned residents and property owners of the State of Illinois respectfully submit these comments in response to the April 26, 2012 Hearing on Certain Expiring Tax Provisions. Our comments are limited to the Production Tax Credit (PTC) for wind energy.

**Executive Summary:** The PTC is often credited for most of the growth in the wind sector but attributing market activity to the subsidy is overly simplistic and fails to consider other crucial factors driving development. When evaluated against key economic and environment criteria, the cost of the subsidy has proven excessive and the benefits to American taxpayers minimal. If the PTC were to expire, the economics of the industry would shift to States with renewable mandates. Power markets will ultimately confront the real cost of wind energy, and price it accordingly. The overall impact on the industry would be far less severe than proponents claim.

**Supporting Statements:**

**High Cost:** Since adopted in 1992, the cost of the PTC for wind energy has ballooned from $5 million/year in 1998 to $1.5 billion annually today. The open-ended subsidy of 2.2c/kWh in after-tax income represents a pre-tax value of approximately 3.7c/kWh. In many regions of the country the PTC now equals, or is greater than, the wholesale price of power. Even if the PTC were to sunset, taxpayers are still obligated to cover nearly $10 billion in tax credits for wind projects built in the last decade. This is in addition to the $15 billion debt for wind projects eligible under Section 1603 (including anticipated 2012 grants).

**Inefficient:** Since the PTC is uniform across the country it is highly inefficient, supporting poorly sited development in some areas while in other areas supporting projects that would have been built regardless of the credit. This is true in Texas and the Pacific Northwest where wind capacity exceeds transmission capacity and wind is curtailed. In New England the PTC likely pays more subsidy than is necessary owing to aggressive State mandates. Utilities in New England routinely sign long-term power contracts for wind at prices significantly above market.

**Other factors advancing wind development:** The industry insists it's at risk of a slow-down without the PTC. This view ignores other crucial factors driving development including state mandates and natural gas prices. It is not possible given available data to identify the extent to which the PTC has contributed to growth in the sector. In fact, demand for wind has eroded recently due, in part, to states meeting their renewable energy mandates.

---


3 Joint Committee on Taxation, *Present Law And Background Relating To Tax Credits For Electricity Production From Renewable Sources* (2005) 14 https://www.jct.gov/publications.html?func=startdown&id=1579
mandates. Lower natural gas prices further reduced wind's attractiveness as a 'fuel saver'. The EIA now forecasts flat growth in the wind sector for this decade regardless of what happens with the PTC\(^4\).

**Job losses:** Despite billions in public funding the wind sector experienced a net loss of 10,000 direct and indirect jobs in 2010 bringing the total to 75,000\(^5\) jobs. Most of the remaining jobs are temporary construction positions requiring peak levels of development year-after-year to maintain current levels. Attempts to attribute job creation to the PTC must be tempered with corresponding job losses due to higher renewable energy prices. The State of Vermont found that adding just 50 MWs of renewable energy at higher-than-market electricity prices "had the deleterious effects of reshuffling consumer spending and increasing the cost of production for Vermont businesses\(^6\)." Last year, rural electric ratepayers in Minnesota paid more than $70 million in above-market energy prices due to the high cost of wind\(^7\).

**Environmental benefits:** Wind energy is an unpredictable, variable resource that cannot be relied on to serve load. Its primary benefit is in reducing U.S. electric carbon emissions. According the Navigant\(^8\), a four year extension of the PTC could avoid an incremental 170 million tons of CO2. This "best case" estimate is not predicated on an actual working grid region, but if we accept Navigant's estimate the cost to taxpayers is at least $23/ton CO2\(^9\), ten-times the $1.92/ton market price for offsets in the Northeastern states participating in RGGI! The PTC is a high-priced vehicle for very questionable reductions of CO2 emissions.

**Conclusion:** The key question is whether the benefits of the PTC for wind are worth the cost. This 20-year old subsidy is expensive, inefficient, has failed to produce net-job increases that are sustainable, and the cost applied per ton of CO2 is more than 10x the market price of carbon under RGGI. The U.S. power market has undergone significant change since the PTC was adopted, including deregulation. It is not possible to isolate the extent to which the PTC contributes to wind sector growth\(^10\). Without the PTC, project economics would shift to states with RPS policies. The value of renewable credits might rise in response but power markets will ultimately confront the real cost of wind energy, and price it accordingly.

---


\(^5\) Wiser and Bolinger v - Note: No independent audits exist to confirm job counts. Since any new job in the electricity sector must contribute to increasing the cost of electricity, this creates economic de-stimulus.


\(^8\) Navigant Consulting, Inc. *Impact of the Production Tax Credit on the U.S. Wind Market* (2011) 38

\(^9\) Navigant provides no detail on how it determined offsets. Study assumes some wind built without the PTC and only looked at incremental benefit over 4 years (2013-16). The cost per offset is potentially higher than $23/ton.

\(^10\) Joint Committee on Taxation 14
Supplemental Sheet

Submitted by:
Cindy Ihrke
1458 North  1700 East Rd
Roberts, IL 60962
(217) 841-8120

Date submitted: May 10, 2012

Comments submitted on behalf of the following residents and property owners of the State of Illinois.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Greg Ainsworth</th>
<th>Tom Best</th>
<th>Wendy Best</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Piper City, IL</td>
<td>9232 Gulfstream Rd</td>
<td>9232 Gulfstream Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frankfort, IL</td>
<td>Frankfort, IL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chris Bliech</th>
<th>Dave Bliech</th>
<th>Deliane Bliech</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1325 North State Route 115</td>
<td>1325 North State Route 115</td>
<td>206 East Green Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jerry Bliech</th>
<th>Juanita Bliech</th>
<th>Sylvia Bliech</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1279 North State Route 115</td>
<td>1279 North State Route 115</td>
<td>206 East Green Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kathy Bormann</th>
<th>Darrell Cambron</th>
<th>Kim Cambron</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>601 Highham, IL</td>
<td>2736 E. 3700 North Road</td>
<td>2736 E. 3700 North Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rankin, IL</td>
<td>Rankin, IL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Judy L. Campbell</th>
<th>Tye Campbell</th>
<th>Joe Cusack</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>28816 N 800 East Rd</td>
<td>28816 N 800 East Rd</td>
<td>32174 N. 1400 East Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manville, IL</td>
<td>Manville, IL</td>
<td>Blackstone,, IL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Melinda Cusack</th>
<th>Cynthia Dunmire</th>
<th>David Dunmire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>32174 N. 1400 East Road</td>
<td>2182 E 2250 N Road</td>
<td>2182 E 2250 N Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blackstone,, IL</td>
<td>Carlock, IL 61738</td>
<td>Carlock, IL 61738</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Betty Eganhouse</th>
<th>Barbara Ellsworth</th>
<th>Michael Ellsworth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>209 Barley</td>
<td>2379 E 2450th Rd</td>
<td>2379 E 2450th Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Naperville, IL</td>
<td>Marseilles, IL</td>
<td>Marseilles, IL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jim Fetzer</th>
<th>Joann Fetzer</th>
<th>Rick Flessner</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N 700 E Rd</td>
<td>N 700 E Rd</td>
<td>102 East Cemetery Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sibley, IL</td>
<td>Sibley, IL</td>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ed Fremel</th>
<th>Nelvie Fremel</th>
<th>Donovan Gaines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11044 Denny Ave</td>
<td>11044 Denny Ave</td>
<td>210 East Green Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mokena, IL</td>
<td>Mokena, IL</td>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Carolyn Gerwin
705 South Locust Street
Pontiac, IL

Rich Hannaway
6937 W Monee Rd.
Monee, IL

Gloria Gonigam
P.O. Box 386
Walnut, IL

Jan Hannaway
6937 W Monee Rd.
Monee, IL

Jim Harlow
698 140th Avenue
Monmouth, IL

Ruth Harlow
698 140th Avenue
Monmouth, IL

Robert Hellmuth
8450 Country Lane
DeKalb, IL

Sherry Hellmuth
8450 Country Lane
DeKalb, IL

Lauren Hellmuth
8450 Country Lane
DeKalb, IL

Jim Harlow
698 140th Avenue
Monmouth, IL

Jan Hannaway
6937 W Monee Rd.
Monee, IL

Jill Hopkins
1650 E 1100 N Road
Loda, IL 60948

Christina Hott
075 N 2400 East Rd
Hoopeston, IL 60942

Cathy Hunter
311 North Locust Street,
Roberts, IL

Amber Ihrke
1501 Bellchase Dr.
New Lenox, IL

Ann Ihrke
1441 N 1800 E Rd
Buckley, IL

Cindy Ihrke
1458 Norh t 1700 East Rd
Roberts, IL

Dan Ihrke
1458 Norh t 1700 East Rd
Roberts, IL

David Ihrke
1501 Bellchase Dr.
New Lenox, IL

George Ihrke M.D.
1441 N 1800 E Rd
Buckley, IL

Cathy Kahle
1242E. 2000N Road
Chatsworth, IL

Steve Kahle
1242E 2000N Road
Chatsworth, IL

Giles Kalvelage
924 German Rd
Paw Paw, IL

Jim Kirby
11742 Highwood Dr.
Palos Park, IL

Mary Kirby
11742 Highwood Dr.
Palos Park, il

John Knilands
7 Lane Drive
Paxton, IL

Nancy Knilands
7 Lane Drive
Paxton, IL

Bradd Kruse
434 Indian Head Road
Harmon, IL

David Kruse
203 Eakle Road,
Harmon, IL

Gene Kruse
494 Indian Head Road
Harmon, IL

Kendra Kruse
203 Eakle Road,
Harmon, IL

Lauren Kruse
434 Indian Head Road
Harmon, IL
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Address 1</th>
<th>Address 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sandra Kruse</td>
<td>494 Indian Head Road</td>
<td>Wayne Kubek</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harmon, IL</td>
<td>24053 S Lakeside Tr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Crete, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geri Lichtenstein</td>
<td>20355 Hilltop Road</td>
<td>Edward Lichtenstein</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mokena, IL</td>
<td>20355 Hilltop Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mokena, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Lowrey</td>
<td>11413 Waterman Road</td>
<td>Peggy Lowrey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Waterman, IL</td>
<td>11413 Waterman Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Waterman, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steven Lustfeldt</td>
<td>112 S. Evergreen Street</td>
<td>David J. MacDonald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Onarga, IL 60955</td>
<td>Onarga, IL 60955</td>
<td>8292 Edgewater Drive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Carlock, IL 61725</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharon S. MacDonald</td>
<td>8292 Edgewater Drive</td>
<td>Joel Martin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Carlock, IL 61725</td>
<td>1553N 1800E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Buckley, IL 60918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susie Miller</td>
<td>1470 Baldyville Road</td>
<td>John Pope</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ashton, IL</td>
<td>9905 W. 125th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Palos Park, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rich Porter</td>
<td>Paxton, IL</td>
<td>Beth Jo Poshard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>248 Fairway Vista Rd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Murphysboro, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Preller</td>
<td>19544 North 1300 East</td>
<td>Dennis Probasco,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hudson, IL</td>
<td>13133 Mowers Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kings, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kelly Robery</td>
<td>1461 Franklin Creek Drive</td>
<td>Steve Robery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Franklin Grove, IL 61031</td>
<td>1461 Franklin Creek Drive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Franklin Grove, IL 61031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sherry Schindt</td>
<td>398 County Road 2500N</td>
<td>Casey Schwartz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mahomet, IL</td>
<td>106 North Walnut</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Roberts, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Shure</td>
<td>044 E 900 North Road</td>
<td>Rita Shure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Buckley, IL</td>
<td>044 E 900 North Road</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Buckley, IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Betty Jo Poshard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deinse Preller</td>
<td>19544 North 1300 East</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hudson, IL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donna Probasco,</td>
<td>13133 Mowers Road</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kings, IL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Probasco,</td>
<td>13133 Mowers Road</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Kings, IL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sherry Schwartz</td>
<td>22761 N 1300 E</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joe Schwartz</td>
<td>106 North Walnut</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Betty Smith</td>
<td>502 Albers St.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Golden, IL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
David Smith
520 West Patton
Paxton, IL

Debbie Smith
520 West Patton
Paxton, IL

Diane Stroh
11124 Second St.
Mokena, IL

Rebecca Stroh
19939 Mokena St
Mokena, IL

Richard Stroh
11124 Second St.
Mokena, IL

Judy Stromsland
36765 Irish Land
Custer Park, IL

Ken Stromsland
36765 Irish Land
Custer Park, IL

Betty Thompson
308 Adda Street
Roberts, IL

Jim Thompson
308 Adda Street
Roberts, IL

James N. Timble
1479 Old Mill Rd
Franklin Grove, IL

Karen Timble
1479 Old Mill Rd
Franklin Grove, IL

Robert Turacek
280 Biscayne
Bloomingdale, IL

Anne Uhe
8429 Edgewater Dr.
Carlock, IL

Ronald Uhe
8429 Edgewater Dr.
Carlock, IL

John Viner
315 North Locust Street
Roberts, IL

Rita W asmer
1640E. 1600N Road
Roberts, IL

Terry W asmer
1640E 1600N Road
Roberts, IL

John Viner
315 North Locust Street
Roberts, IL

Jody Watson
22660 S. Harlem Ave
Frankfort, IL

Robert Watson
22660 S. Harlem Ave
Frankfort, IL

Don Wilmont
704 Stacey Dr.
New Lenox, IL

Amy Zima
100 Joyce Pl.
Park Ridge, IL

Robert Zima
100 Joyce Pl.
Park Ridge, IL

Jed A. Gerdes
1448 CR 2700E
Ogden, IL 61859

Bette Gebhardt
502 N. 28th
Quincy, IL

John Gebhardt
503 N 28th St
Quincy, IL